

# **COMMITTEE REPORT**

Item No 5

APPLICATION DETAIL	.S		
Application No:	18/0160/FUL		
Location:	200A Guisborough Road Middlesbrough TS7 0JG		
Proposal:	Raising of the existing building roof height to include 3 roof lights on the front elevation and two dormer windows and two roof lights to rear, extension to the front and rear of the garage and provision of first floor extension above the garage to include three dormer windows and external staircase, single storey extension to rear and alterations to existing windows		
Applicant:	Mr & Mrs Williamson		
Agent: Company Name:	Mr Andrew Riley AJ RILEY ARCHITECTS		
Ward:	Nunthorpe		
Recommendation:	mendation: Approve with Conditions		

## SUMMARY

The application seeks permission for the raising of the roof height of the dwelling, constructing two dormer windows on the rear roof slope, erecting a single storey rear extension, an extension to the existing garage and pitched roof as well as additional roof lights and alterations to existing windows in the front elevation of the dwelling.

Following the consultation exercise three objections have been received relating to the loss of privacy, loss of trees and bird nesting sites, negative impact on the character and appearance of the street scene, increase in footprint, loss of light, the suggestion that the works are contrary to Middlesbrough Urban Design Statement and Supplementary Planning Documents and the potential of a commercial use at the site.

The property is a relatively large dwelling set within extensive grounds. The proposed extent of development has been reduced since the initial submission to lessen the scale of the amendments and additions to the garage. The proposed works are considered to be of a nature and scale commensurate with a dwelling of this scale and are considered to not unduly affect the privacy or amenity associated with surrounding properties given their position and orientation.

The development if considered to be in accordance with the requirements of relevant policies DC1, CS4, CS5, Urban Design Guide and Nunthorpe Design SPD.

The application is recommended for approval subject to standard conditions.

## SITE AND SURROUNDINGS AND PROPOSED WORKS

The application site is a detached property at 200A Guisborough Road. The property is located within the Nunthorpe area of Middlesbrough. Along the western boundary is 200 and 200d Guisborough Road and to the south are bungalows at 12 and 14 Moor Green. To the east is 198 Guisborough Road. Directly opposite the property to the north are 159 and 161 Guisborough Road.

Since the original submission the plans have been altered to remove the initially proposed first floor above the garage and the two-storey extension to the side.

The proposal is for the following works:-

- a) Raising of the original ridgeline roof height by 1.5 metres
- b) Insertion of 3 roof lights on the front elevation
- c) Two dormer windows and two roof lights on the rear elevation
- d) Single storey rear extension projecting 3.9 metres with a width of 9.6 metres and flat roof height of 3.5 metres with two roof lanterns.
- e) Alterations to the windows on the front elevation
- f) Front extension to the garage projecting 4 metres with the installation of a pitched roof with a maximum ridgeline roof height of 4.5 metres.
- g) Installation of two windows on the east elevation (en-suite and robe room).

## PLANNING HISTORY

There have been no previous planning applications for the property.

A current planning application has been submitted for crown thinning, crown reduction, crown raising and felling works to various trees including beech, poplar, sycamore, ash, oak and horse chestnuts in the front garden area which is being considered under application 18/0287/TPO.

## PLANNING POLICY

In accordance with Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004, Local Planning Authorities must determine applications for planning permission in accordance with the Development Plan(s) for the area, unless material considerations indicate otherwise. Section 143 of the Localism Act requires the Local Planning Authority to take local finance considerations into account. Section 70(2) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended) requires Local Planning Authorities, in dealing with an application for planning permission, to have regard to:

a) The provisions of the development plan, so far as material to the application

- b) Any local finance considerations, so far as material to the application and
- c) Any other material considerations.

The following documents together comprise the Development Plan for Middlesbrough;

Middlesbrough Local Plan;

- Housing Local Plan (2014)
- Core Strategy DPD (2008, policies which have not been superseded/deleted only)
- Regeneration DPD (2009, policies which have not been superseded/deleted only)
- Tees Valley Joint Minerals and Waste Core Strategy DPD (2011)
- Tees Valley Joint Minerals and Waste Policies & Sites DPD (2011)
- Middlesbrough Local Plan (1999, Saved Policies only) and
- Marton West Neighbourhood Plan (2016, applicable in Marton West Ward only).

The overarching principle of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) is to support sustainable development, and that it should go ahead without delay. It defines the role of planning in achieving economically, socially and environmentally sustainable development and recognises that each are mutually dependent. The NPPF requires local planning authorities to approach development management decisions positively, utilising twelve core planning principles, which can be summarised as follows:

- Being plan led
- Enhancing and improving areas
- Proactively drive and support sustainable economic development to deliver homes, business, industry and infrastructure and a thriving local economy
- Always seek a high quality of design and good standard of amenity for existing and future occupants
- Take account the different roles of areas, promoting the vitality of the main urban areas whilst recognising the intrinsic character of the countryside
- Support the transition to a low carbon future, taking full account of flood risk, resources and renewables
- Contribute to conserving and enhancing the natural environment
- Encourage the effective use of land
- Promote mixed use developments
- Conserve heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance
- Actively manage patterns of growth making fullest use public transport, walking and cycling and focus significant development in sustainable locations and
- Take account of local strategies to support health, social and cultural well-being and deliver community and cultural facilities to meet local needs.

The planning policies and key areas of guidance that are relevant to the consideration of the application are:

CS4 - Sustainable Development CS5 - Design DC1 - General Development UDSPD - Urban Design SPD NDS - Nunthorpe Design SPD

The detailed policy context and guidance for each policy is viewable within the relevant Local Plan documents, which can be accessed at the following web address. https://www.middlesbrough.gov.uk/planning-and-housing/planning/planning-policy

## CONSULTATION AND PUBLICITY RESPONSES

Three objection comments have been received following the neighbour consultation process from 10,12 and 14 Moor Green which in summary relate to :-

- a) Loss of privacy
- b) Loss of Trees and bird nesting sites
- c) Three storey height will have a negative impact on the character and appearance of the street scene
- d) Increase in internal and external dimensions of the property
- e) Not in accordance with Middlesborough Urban Design Statement and Supplementary Planning Documents.
- f) Garage alterations result in the Impact on daylight to 198 Guisborough Road
- g) Office space above the garage implies a commercial use

An objection comment from 198 Guisborough Road has been withdrawn following the submission of the revised plans.

### **Public Responses**

Number of original neighbour consultation	r consultations 9	
Total numbers of comments received	4	
Total number of objections	3	
Total number of support	0	
Total number of representations	0	

## PLANNING CONSIDERATION AND ASSESSMENT

#### Principle of Development

- 1. The Local Development Plan is the starting point for considering this proposal along with other material planning considerations. The proposal should therefore be assessed against Local Plan Policies DC1 (General Development), CS4 (Sustainable Development) and CS5 (Design) which seek to ensure high quality sustainable development, ensure the amenity of nearby residents and that the character of the area and highway safety are not adversely affected by development. Policy CS5 requires high quality design in terms of layout, form and contribution to the character and appearance of the area and consideration must be given to Middlesbrough's Urban Design SPD (adopted Jan 2013) and the Nunthorpe Design Supplementary Planning Document (adopted September 2011).
- 2. The main considerations with this proposal are the effects on the character and appearance of the street scene, on the privacy and amenity of the neighbouring properties and the effect on highway safety.

#### Character and appearance

- 3. The application site is a detached property located within the Nunthorpe area of Middlesbrough. The Nunthorpe Design Supplementary Planning Document (NDSPD) characterises Guisborough Road as consisting of high quality large detached properties in large plots with some recent in-fill development. The NDSPD comments that, given the nature of the continual development of the area there is no collective character.
- 4. The character of the buildings on the south side of Guisborough Road are a mixture of house type designs with both brick work and render and both traditional red roof tiles and green tiles. The properties are set back from the main highway with

individual driveways and both detached and attached garages with large rear gardens. Several of the properties have established trees located within the front garden areas with some trees being protected.

- 5. The proposal includes a four metre extension to the front of the existing garage with a pitched roof which would continue over the existing garage. Extensions to the front of properties are generally not suitable in areas of uniformly laid out properties as they can impact on the building line and character of the street scene. In this instance, the proposed forward extension would not be at odds with the layout of surrounding properties and given the scale of the plot and the set back from the highway, would not be dominant of the character of the property / area. Given the existing character of the street scene, the overall design and projection length of the garage extension is considered to be in keeping with the host property and surroundings.
- 6. The proposal seeks to increase the overall ridge height of the property by 1.5 metres whilst retaining the pitched roof design. Objection comments have been received regarding the increase in roof height and the impact on the character of the street scene. Along this section of Guisborough Road there are varying roof heights to properties and some which have a similar ridgeline to that which is proposed. As such, it is considered that this alteration will not have a detrimental impact on the overall character and appearance of the street scene.
- 7. The proposed alterations to the rear of the property include a single storey extension and two pitched roof dormer windows within the rear roof slope, neither of which will be particularly visible from the street. The property has an existing modern flat roofed extension to the rear and therefore the proposed flat roofed single storey extension with roof lanterns is considered would be in keeping with the original character. The dormer windows would be of a scale and design subservient to the existing roof.
- 8. The proposed extensions and alterations would result in only a limited increase to the overall footprint of the dwelling which is considered to be acceptable given the scale of this property, its associated curtilage and that of the surrounding properties.
- 9. The brick work and roof tiles for the garage and the render and roof riles for the main dwelling are considered to be in keeping with the character of the original property.
- 10. Overall, the proposal is considered to not have a significant impact on the character and appearance of the area and accords with the guidance set out in Local Plan Policies CS5- Design, DC1- General Development and the NDSPD.

#### Privacy and Amenity

#### 198 Guisborough Road

- 11. After initially objecting to the proposed development, the neighbours at 198 Guisborough Road have withdrawn their objection following the submission of the revised plans to reduce the extent of works to the garage.
- 12. Both the extension to the rear and the garage extension will be visible from no. 198 although no windows are proposed within their side elevations which would face towards no. 198. The increase in roof height will result in an additional two non-habitable windows, (en-suite and robe room) within the side elevation of the existing gable elevation facing no. 198. As both of these windows serve non-habitable rooms

it is considered that there would be no significant impact on the privacy associated with the neighbouring property.

- 13. The proposed alterations include a set of bi-folding doors on the single storey rear extension and two dormer windows in the rear roof slope. Both the bi-folding doors and the dormer windows will be at an oblique angle to the neighbours main dwelling and rear garden area at 198 Guisborough Road. With the applicant's property having existing windows to the rear, the proposed windows and bi-folding doors are not considered to have any additional impact on privacy for neighbours.
- 14. The application seeks permission to erect a 4 metre projection to the front of the garage and a pitched roof above. The rear elevation of the extended garage will be in-line with the current garage rear elevation which is a minimum of 0.5 metres from the boundary fence with 198 Guisborough Road and 15 metres from its side elevation. The proposal also seeks to increase the dwellings roof by 1.5 metres, the side elevation of which is approx. 4 metres from the boundary with 198 Guisborough Road. Taking into consideration the separation distances that will remain between the applicant's property/garage and the neighbour's main dwelling, the proposal is considered to not have an overbearing impact on these neighbours.
- 15. The applicant's property is located to the west of the neighbours at 198 Guisborough Road and taking into consideration the location of the proposed extensions and the sun's orientation, the proposal is considered to not have a significant impact in terms of loss of light to these neighbours.

#### 200 Guisborough Road

- 16. The proposed garage extension will have no windows that will face towards the neighbours at 200 Guisborough Road. The alterations to the position and design of windows on the front elevation and the two roof lights will not directly face either the main dwelling or front garden at 200 Guisborough Road. The single storey extension to the rear will have no windows on the side elevation that would face these neighbours. The bi-folding doors, two dormer windows and roof lights on the rear elevation will be at an oblique angle to the neighbour's rear garden area and given their location are not considered to have a significant impact in terms of loss of privacy.
- 17. The side elevation of the applicant's property will be located 4 metres from the side elevation of the neighbour's property at 200 Guisborough Road. Taking the separation distance into consideration along with the fact the applicant's property will be located to the east of these neighbours means there is considered to be no significant impact in terms of overbearing or loss of light to these neighbours.

## 10,12 and 14 Moor Green

18. Towards the rear boundary of the application site are detached bungalows at 10,12 and 14 Moor Green. Objection comments have been received regarding the loss of privacy. The single storey extension includes a set of bi-folding doors on the rear elevation with the proposal including two dormer windows and roof lights. The bi-folding doors, dormer windows and roof lights will be located a minimum of 57 metres from the rear elevation windows of 10,12 and 14 Moor Green. The guidance distance considered acceptable in terms of privacy set out in the Council's Urban Design Guide Supplementary Planning Document is 21 metres and therefore the proposal is not considered to have a significant impact in terms of loss of privacy or amenity on these properties.

## Highway Safety

19. The proposal will extend the existing garage to provide three garage spaces. The property has an additional area of hard standing to the front. The alterations will provide four bedrooms which according to the Council's Design Guide Specification should provide three car parking spaces which can be accommodated within the curtilage of the property and there are no highway safety issues.

### Residual matters

- 20. Objections have been received to the removal of trees and the impact on nesting. A separate application has been submitted for works to the protected trees to the front of the site which will assess the suitability of any works to the trees. The submitted plans show no alterations to the trees within the rear garden however these trees are not protected and could be removed without planning permission.
- 21. An objection comment has been received relating to the commercial use of the first floor of the garage. The revised plans have removed the first floor above the garage from the scheme.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONDITIONS**

### **Approve with Conditions**

1. <u>Approved plans</u>

The development hereby approved shall be carried out in complete accordance with the following plans:-

Existing floor plan drawing 01 dated 19th March 2018 Existing elevation drawing 02 dated 19th March 2018 Proposed floor plan drawing 03A dated 9th May 2018 Proposed elevation drawing 04A dated 9th May 2018 Block plan drawing 05A dated 9th May 2018

Reason: To ensure a satisfactory form of development and for the avoidance of doubt.

#### 2. <u>Materials</u>

The materials used in the construction of the walls and roof of the garage, hereby approved, shall match those of the existing building unless otherwise agreed by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure a satisfactory form of development.

## **REASON FOR APPROVAL**

This application is satisfactory in that the design of the proposed extensions and alterations accord with the principles of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and, where appropriate, the Council has worked with the applicant in a positive and proactive way in line with paragraphs 186-187 of the NPPF. In addition the extensions and alterations accords with the local policy requirements (Policies CS4, CS5 & DC1 of the Council's Local Development Framework).

In particular the extension and alterations are designed so that their appearance is complementary to the existing dwelling house and so that they will not have a detrimental impact on the amenity of any adjoining or nearby resident. The extensions and alterations will not prejudice the appearance of the area and do not significantly affect any landscaping nor prevent adequate and safe access to the dwelling.

The application is therefore considered to be an acceptable form of development, fully in accordance with the relevant policy guidance and there are no material considerations which would indicate that the development should be refused.

INFORMATIVES	
None	
Case Officer:	Debbie Moody
Committee Date:	8 <sup>th</sup> June 2018

